CONTEXT
The Brussels Low Carbon Study (February 2017)

This study undertaken by Brussels Environment has provided the Brussels Capital Region with a tool to establish its low-carbon strategy. The scenarios highlighted in the study will only come to life if we are able to collaborate across sectors and positions; change mindsets of individuals and organisations; and co-create new solutions. Such a synergy relies on a future-proof model of governance for cities.

Idea of a forum

In order to kick-off the discussion on a governance model for a low-carbon city, Brussels Environment organised the Low Carbon Forum on June 22, 2018.
An urban challenge

As a true concentrate of energy consumption, the city offers an exciting field of reflection. By 2050, nearly 3 out of 4 people will live in cities. As a medium sized city (between 1 and 5 million inhabitants), The Brussels Capital Region occupies a special place in this context. Today, there are more than 400 in this category, compared to only about 30 mega-cities. The solutions developed in Brussels are therefore likely to interest a substantial and growing part of the world population.

As an urban area, the Brussels Capital Region almost entirely relies on imported energy. Among the many challenges, a large population increase and a diminishing composition of the average household imply a densification of the territory. City dwellings are mostly occupied by tenants. It is therefore particularly important to achieve decent housing, fluid mobility, a pleasant living environment and an economic activity that minimizes the production of greenhouse gases.
The urban philosopher, activist and visionary, Benjamin Barber – argued in his seminal 2013 book, ‘If Mayors Ruled the World,’ that cities are “the primary incubator of the cultural, social, and political innovations which shape our planet”. That said, there is no doubt that Brussels has the power to transition to a low carbon society by 2050. The question is how we will do it and what is the path towards an urban collaborative governance.

An urban collaborative governance will be a model that is characterised by the sharing of power, the sharing of authority and relies on collective action and collective accountability.

10 themes to debate the future of governance in Brussels

In order to kick off an inclusive reflection on a governance characterised by collective action and accountability, Brussels Environment pre-identified 10 themes that are essential to discuss and specific to the context of Brussels Capital Region.

Diversity was the essence of the day. The forum has brought together more than 150 actors from different horizons: citizens, universities, entrepreneurs, public authorities and private sector.
Low carbon open forum – Brussels

1. institutional puzzle
2. public-private-philanthropy partnerships
3. debunking the myth of citizen empowerment
4. multi-level urban 3rd spaces
5. foresight on long-term impact and impact measurement

6. collaborative playground for social entrepreneurs
7. co-creating plans and policies
8. communication – shaping the new myths
9. an inclusive approach to learning
10. transparency and the new power
The design of this new model of governance for a low-carbon city cannot be achieved in silo. It needs a collaboration across entities who can be empathetic towards each other and are willing to cooperate for the common good.
The day was divided in two parts: inspiration and co-creation

The morning was dedicated to Inspiration where an international speaker lineup shared with the audience different concepts and case studies followed by a collective future visualisation exercise. Participants later drew visions from the future.

The afternoon focussed on co-creation in smaller groups, where each group worked on one dedicated theme. The results of each group work was then shared in a collective fishbowl.
INSPIRATION - SUMMARY
PRESENTATION
OF THE STUDY

The Brussels Low Carbon Study (February 2017)

On the basis of a sophisticated Belgian calculator, the study develops several scenarios in order to have a more accurate view of the implications of human activity on the territory and to estimate the impacts of measures to be taken in various sectors. To get closer to the reality of the Brussels urban area, these scenarios also take into account indirect emissions.
Sector by sector, the analysis shows that reducing Brussels’ emissions from 80 to 95% is possible but it implies among others:

- A fundamental change in the socio-cultural paradigm, and in all sectors

- A political context favoring the commitment of all decision-makers, companies, universities, citizens ... - in favor of a society that reduces its production of greenhouse gases by consuming differently in all sectors

The modeling tool offers actors a clear framework of action, or even a methodology, so that they can anchor their approaches in a global perspective, but this will above all allow to open the debate on the transition to a low carbon society.
First Panel

**TOPIC** - The first panel, called “Strategies to evolve into a collaborative city: moving beyond institutional hacking” focussed on debating the key ingredients required to co-build a city with a diverse set of actors. In our current times, it is not just the role of governments to tackle the challenges of cities nor can just citizens can accelerate the change alone.

**DISCUSSION** - The speakers in the panel talked about a framework that can host diverse voices, incentivise them and empower them to co-build the city through each of their project experience. Each framework proposed by the speaker reflected a set of practices that are influenced by the design thinking approach such as mapping, prototyping, testing, scaling, experimenting. If a cycle of such practices is put in place it can mobilise diverse actors to align around one vision.

**TAKEAWAYS** - Some of the key takeaways of the panel were gathering basic resources, both human and financial, beforehand is advisable; start with small experiments; involve diversity of actors from the beginning; build collective vision; and measure and show impact.
Visual Harvesting from the first panel: Strategies to evolve into a collaborative city: moving beyond institutional hacking
Second Panel

**TOPIC** - The second panel, called “Design for a transitioning city: innovations that resonate with everyone” focussed on debating the role of open design and innovation in re-imagining our cities. When we talk about design and innovation today, we also have to talk about being empathetic and inclusive. An empathetic design and an inclusive innovation is what a city needs as a transversal layer while working on the transition.

**DISCUSSION** - The three speakers gave three different perspectives to this topic through their practical field experience. The different perspectives discussed were open source platforms as a ignitor of collaborative innovation; finding a balance of synergy between innovators and their vision and a local context and its needs; lastly a system of accountability and mutual recognition as a key driver for win-win relationship between innovators and governments.

**TAKEAWAY** - Some of the key takeaways of the panel were using game theory to incentivise active participation; creative storytelling and building new narratives; and context-focussed innovation.

From left to right:

**Geraldine Bueken** - Moderator and CIN team
**Justyna Swat** - Cofounder at POC21, wikihouse and OpenSpaceMakers
**Simon De Muynck** - coordinator at Urban Ecology Center and Co-create Project “Phosphore”
**Elisabeth Grosdhomme** - General Manager of Paradigmes et Cetera
Visual Harvesting from the second panel: Design for a transitioning city: innovations that resonate with everyone
Wake up in the future

close your eyes...
dee... deep breathing..
... wake up in 2048..
... major breakthroughs..
your home and relationships..
at work ...
Governance ....

Using this method of meditating in a circle facilitated the participants to project themselves in the future and build visions.
FUTURE ILLUSTRATIONS

What would the newspapers of 2048 look like?

This was the outcome of the collective meditation.
COLLECTIVE VISIONS

keywords from the future illustrations

trees, more trees. No cars
free P2P university
magnetic rail station
fresh air
distributed energy production
100% materials are reused
water autonomy
self-sufficient neighbourhoods
100% equality
post-oil international convention
museum of car/waste/etc
last nuclear plan
brussels convention of agoras
multimodal mobility
gamified citizenship
opensource schools
« new ideas » platform across cities, open to everyone
participatory governance
techno-logic
sharing city
eco-digestion (nature digest waste/concrete)
urban agriculture & harvest
labels & certifications for low-carbon – incentives
common interests for common good as guiding symbols
coercition & regulations to attenuate corporate influence
sustainable & short-circuits for supply
relocalize fabrication & city of makers

low-tech
urban forums
engineers & gardeners
outdoor generation
food for all
CO-CREATION - SUMMARY
**OPEN FORUM THEMES**

10 themes discussed by participants in an iterative process building upon each others insights and ideas.

For each theme, groups were asked to highlight challenges, opportunity areas and stepping stones for taking actions across entities.

The results of this ideation session are synthesised for each topic in the next pages.

1. institutional puzzle
2. public-private-philanthropy partnerships
3. foresight on long-term impact and impact measurement
4. multi-level 3rd spaces
5. debunking the myth of citizen empowerment
6. collaborative playground for social entrepreneurs
7. co-creating plans and policies
8. communication - shaping the new myths
9. an inclusive approach to learning
10. transparency and the new power
INSTITUTIONAL PUZZLE

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1 to cross collaborate & empower citizens
   - resource flexibility (budget, allocation people, …)
   - creating online/offline spaces for people to take action

2 to avoid top down culture
   - break through complexity of to many vertical levels
   - empower citizens: engagement, recognition and influence

3 to have vision & consistency
   - recognition of long term goals
   - commitment to transversal issues

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1 to create more visibility for citizen projects
   - involve critical mass (minimum of human commitment to make change happen)
   - harvest collective intelligence

2 to support pilot projects
   - facilitation for local actions & actors
   - cross collaboration between stakeholders

3 to harmonize objectives
   - simplification of structures needed to see opportunities
   - long term engagement for all

GOOD PRACTICE

VICLO
http://vilco.brussels/

Working on the interaction between public authorities and citizens' collective initiatives and understanding how these dynamics work. Ultimately, the challenge is to propose new modes of governance determined with the citizens.
**PUBLIC-PRIVATE-PHILANTHROPY PARTNERSHIPS**

**TOP 3 CHALLENGES**

1. To take into account different strategic timelines
   - short term (politics) versus long term (society)
   - take each other’s influence seriously

2. To innovate inside government
   - support and facilitate innovative private projects
   - assets and capabilities management

3. To do matchmaking on different challenges
   - have neutral actors to facilitate
   - create a foundation for new value sharing

**TOP 3 ACTIONS**

1. To organise projects showcasing how to collaborate
   - public support for innovative private projects and facilitation
   - assets and capabilities management

2. New dynamic public cells going to entrepreneurs
   - sharing knowledge and best practices
   - promoting innovations inside government

3. To have a ‘guardian’ for a shared pos. future vision
   - address shared challenges and gains
   - have neutral actors to facilitate

**GOOD PRACTICE**

GreenLAB / Green tech
[https://www.greentechbrussels.be](https://www.greentechbrussels.be)

An acceleration program for environmental entrepreneurship and the circular economy for start-ups. Funded by the Brussels-Capital Region, it aims to stimulate the development of green entrepreneurship at the regional level.
FORESIGHT ON LONG-TERM IMPACT & IMPACT MEASUREMENT

GOOD PRACTICE

Climate Budget - City of Oslo

“counting carbon dioxide the same way we count money”, the City of Oslo plans to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by 50% compared to 1990 levels by 2020, and by 95% in 2030.

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1 to adapt to new feedback structures and to develop appropriate tools
   - how to make it the new normal?
   - to change habits requires energy and commitment

2 to define common goals & impact indicators
   - to connect actors and initiatives
   - make impact measurement the norm

3 lack of time
   - we live in a society of immediacy
   - to balance exhaustivity versus efficiency

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1 to define common impact indicators
   - clarify what project information to use
   - allow for benchmarking

2 to create awareness through education
   - learn new ways to assess impact (also qualitative)
   - transfer expertise from administration to education

3 to design smart partnerships
   - social (impact) bonds
   - innovation through cross-fertilization
MULTI-LEVEL 3rd SPACES*

* THIRD SPACES ARE MICRO-ECOSYSTEMS
THEY HAVE THE CITY'S DNA THEY ATTRACT INNOVATORS
THEY ARE SAFE SPACES OPEN TO NEW IDEAS, NEW APPROACHES
THEY OFFER AN EQUAL FOOTING TO ALL PARTICIPANTS
NATIONAL, REGIONAL, METROPOLITAN, AND LOCAL LEVELS.

GOOD PRACTICE

GreenBiz
www.greenbizz.brussels

Brussels, Greenbizz offers companies and startups 8000 m2 of infrastructure and services to create and develop their green, sustainable or environmentally related projects.

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1. the resistance to change
   - lack of support from public authorities
   - lack of voluntary participation

2. to scale up experiments
   - to create commitment (human capital and financial)
   - to transform incubators into places of good governance

3. to maintain online and offline spaces (online platforms or physical spaces to meet & work)
   - usage, governance and awareness challenges
   - to introduce all stakeholders to civic participation

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1. to systematize the provision of unoccupied public spaces for projects contributing to a low carbon city
   - physical and virtual spaces
   - to equip for prototyping and testing

2. to connect and create network of spaces
   - call for projects organised by the communities
   - mapping initiatives and consult

3. to exchange programmes with other cities
   - to encourage experiments
   - to achieve universal city ecosystem design
DEBUNKING THE MYTH OF CITIZEN EMPOWERMENT

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1. to shrink distance between politics and citizens
   - politics recognizing citizen actions
   - tackle lack of specific technical knowledge among citizens

2. to encourage multi stakeholder dialogue
   - to embrace diversity among citizens
   - to build shared vision and ability to shape the system

3. to get rid of the dictature of short term
   - a need for long-term commitment
   - avoid lack of integrity

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1. to install education system that develops competences for empowerment
   - afternoon “school” on citizen initiatives
   - install an agora for developing citizen culture

2. to launch bottom-up social cohesion projects
   - facilitate people’s projects
   - share “makerspaces” for diverse public

3. to create common ownership projects
   - new democracy approaches (e.g. participative citizen democr.)
   - have common goals for social experiments and development

GOOD PRACTICE

DecideMadrid
https://decide.madrid.es/

A platform for public participation in decision making, was launched by Madrid city council. Decide Madrid has four main functions: proposals and votes for new local laws; debates; participatory budgeting; and consultations.
COLLABORATIVE PLAYGROUND FOR SOCIAL ENTREPRENEURS

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1 to integrate green projects into the current markets where ...
   - speed is more important than quality
   - political and business as usual gets priority

2 to break the silos
   - to educate, work and train together
   - to implement collaboration tools

3 to rethink tenders & subsidies
   - pushing different actors to collaborate and apply
   - more long-term thinking

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1 to officialise the functioning of social cooperatives
   - each administration should invest a little in at least one social activity
   - more information and exchange

2 to design a framework of value distribution and governance for collaborative ventures
   - new hybrid models of structures
   - adapted legal support

3 to encourage investment mechanisms for new multi-agent collaborative ventures
   - active participation of public and private actors

GOOD PRACTICE

CircularBerlin
http://circular.berlin/

An open initiative promoting a collaborative environment in the form of engagement platform for diverse groups of stakeholders to unlock the potential of cross-sectorial connectivity and to accelerate Berlin transition to a circular city.
CO-CREATING PLANS AND POLICIES

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1. To determine ownership and governance
   - Dilution of responsibilities over time
   - To break through stalls in decision-making process

2. To manage individual interest versus commonality of interest
   - Climate of competition
   - Commit until the end of the process

3. To shift mindset for co-creation
   - Multi-stakeholder sessions
   - From ‘behind the mirror’ to ‘directly interfacing’

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1. To redesign the administration for civic engagement
   - To have intrapreneurs within the administration
   - To go from top-down to horizontal governance

2. Define new criteria for calls for projects which ...
   - Requires participative nature
   - Requires communication strategy to share results

3. To launch online & offline innovation hubs
   - Topic-wise hubs for better regulation
   - Organized knowledge management

GOOD PRACTICE

Stadlab 2050
wat-stadslab2050

Stadlab 2050 is formed by the entire group of citizens, institutions, companies and government departments looking for ways to turn Antwerp into a sustainable city.
COMMUNICATION - SHAPING THE NEW MYTHS

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1 to draft a common vision
  - sharing failures, dreams and practices
  - use a language that is understood by all

2 to reach everyone (not only the convinced)
  - translate long-term benefits into short term ones
  - communicate effectively about results

3 to design systems for transdisciplinary communication
  - inclusive approach to different viewpoints
  - to communicate the successes and learnings from projects

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1 develop civic-tech tools and/or platforms
  - partnerships with other cities or countries
  - make possible connections between citizens interested or engaged in the same fields

2 enforcing a feedback culture across the city
  - social validation through peer feedback
  - stories and advice from experts

3 creating and designing integrated spaces
  - create awareness through events
  - work together with local real estate agencies

GOOD PRACTICE

Good Planet
www.goodplanet.be

Encourages all generations to engage and build a sustainable society through the implementation of positive actions and sharing of expertise.
AN INCLUSIVE APPROACH TO LEARNING

BRIDGING THE DIGITAL GAP
NEW SKILLS TRAININGS FOR INSTITUTIONS AND CITIZENS
PEER-TO-PEER LEARNING

The Carbon Literacy Project
www.carbonliteracy.com

The Carbon Literacy Project (CLP), originating in Manchester, offers everyone who works, lives or studies in the city and wider area, a day’s worth of Carbon Literacy learning: climate change, carbon footprints, how you can do your bit, and why it is relevant to you and your audience.

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1 to learn next to academic focus on knowledge …
   - about the mindset of the society
   - how to be rigid and individual thinkers

2 to prepare ‘future leaders’
   - to learn new (soft-)skills for the future

3 make ideas visible & create communication value
   - how to distinguish communication versus propaganda?
   - how to bridge the digital gap?

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1 to encourage a lifelong learning approach that is …
   - ongoing, voluntary, and self-motivated
   - supported by counselling services throughout the education

2 to build out participatory learning
   - in schools as they are a good place to build collectively
   - though citizenship courses

3 to encourage personal development modules for adults
   - to empower, grow their awareness and identity
   - to build informed, action oriented human capital
TRANSPARENCY AND THE NEW POWER

DEFINE THE NEW POWER AND ITS DISTRIBUTION
NEW FORMS OF COOPERATIVISM AND DEMOCRATIC INNOVATION

TOP 3 CHALLENGES

1. To base policies not only on quantitative data
   - Narrow debate on how to use (open) data
   - To use city data & create policies to regulate it

2. To re-evaluate taxations & funding
   - To encourage vision-engagement on the long-term
   - How to grow available collective spaces or platforms?

3. To have more citizen involvement & participation
   - To support citizen initiatives
   - To allocate participation budget

TOP 3 ACTIONS

1. To define new power and its distribution
   - To investigate new roles, entities, ...
   - To build new forms of cooperativism

2. To have citizen workgroups to re-shape the system
   - Referendums on important topics
   - To encourage participatory democracy

GOOD PRACTICE

Urban Glass
www.urban-glass.org

Urban glass promotes transparent and accountable local governments for sustainable cities.
FISHBOWL

A participative format, called Fishbowl, brought all the participants in a circular setting to close the intense brainstorming of the afternoon sessions. During this session, the participants were the stars and the discussions and insights emerged collectively. Some key insights were:

- lack of empathy triggers silos
- challenges are huge but collaboration can make it easier
- we need a common language when we talk about challenges and visions
Closing Keynote

The closing keynote by Olivier De Schutter summed-up the whole day and gave participants a holistic vision on the governance for a low-carbon society.

His presentation started with diagnosis of blockages through five bolts - I. socio-technical choices favoring economies of scale and standardization; II. dominant economic positions and persistence of inequalities; III. lifestyles - cultural barriers - the politics of time, gender and space; IV. link between political economy and the political decisions; V. Governance of power driven and short-term.

The rest of the presentation followed the framework of:

**The scenario approach**
1. For "soft" planning combining direction and experimentation - spanning the short and the long term & measuring progress
2. To rebuild the social capital
3. To promote co-construction

**The three levers**
1. Political, civic, and economic logic
2. Hybrid governance mechanisms
3. The idea of a partner city: policies time and space
In 2020, the Brussels Capital Region will adopt a low carbon development strategy at the horizon 2050. The different scenarios of the low carbon study show that a reduction of 80 to 95% of our greenhouse gas emissions by 2050 is within our reach but this requires a paradigm shift in all sectors.

The low carbon forum, in addition to being the starting point for this strategy, has helped develop ideas that will form its basis. Participants had the opportunity to discuss a rich source of opportunities, challenges, questions, innovations, trajectories, ideas and stories.

One thing is certain: we are all convinced of the importance of the participation of society as a whole in the low carbon transition. Only an inclusive governance that gives equal space to all stakeholders will enable the Region to achieve the ambitious objectives that will be reflected in Brussels’ low carbon strategy.

Send us your new ideas!

While waiting for an upcoming meeting, Brussels Environment invites you to continue to feed the reflection by sending us your new ideas on governance for a low carbon society via our online suggestion box: lowcarbon@environnement.brussels
TEAM AND RESOURCES
TEAM

Facilitator circle

Ana Adzersen
Esra Tat
Marco Paunovic
Michaela Sieh
Pierre Bosser
Quentin de Pret
Sven Jacobs
Timothée Brès
Toha De Brant

JULIEN BERRY
Project Manager
jberry@environnement.brussels

PIERRE-ALEXANDRE KLEIN
Project lead
pa@civicinnovation.network

KHUSHBOO BALWANI
Content lead
khushboo@civicinnovation.network

ARNOUM SMEETS
Design lead
arnout@civicinnovation.network

ALINE VEULEMANS
Coordinator
aveulemans@environnement.brussels
is the motto of Civic Innovation network (CIN), a Brussels-based lab facilitating the co-creation of joint ventures and developing systemic tools for urban resilience. The design, content of the 10 topics and facilitation of the day was guided by the team of CIN.
CONTACT INFORMATION

For more info

Contact Brussels Environment team: Aline Veulemans (aveulemans@environnement.brussels)

Forum website: http://bascarbone.environnement.brussels/
Civic Innovation Network: www.civicinnovation.network

Media:
Visual harvests from the forum
Photos of the forum
Presentations of the speakers

Acknowledgements

PHOTOGRAPHS
Tama Rchika, Bibiana Sequeda and Ouishare commons

VISUAL HARVEST
Kristoff | https://visualharvesting.com/
Illustration of 10 themes image:
Luca Carrara #Underdog

ICONS
Noun project: Institution by Gregor Cresnar; citizens by MRFA; Non Profit helping hand by Reazur Rahman; corporations by I Putu Kharismayadi; university by Stock Image Folio; entrepreneur by Chanut